Anti-racism framework for Initial Teacher Education/Training: Literature Review Chart
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key themes</th>
<th>Impact</th>
<th>Authors/ key reports</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Directives from the state focus on equality and diversity, avoiding specific reference to anti-racist pedagogies in ITE | • Reality of institutional racism is diminished  
• Too much focus on knowledge of the Equality Act 2010 and placement schools/ ITE providers EandD policy as opposed to developing and embedding anti-racist practice  
• Racist or Eurocentric narratives are reproduced | Gillborn (2002, 2005, 2013, 2018, 2019)  
DfE, Teachers Standards (2011)  
Ofsted, ITE inspection Framework (2021)  
Ahmed (2012)  
Osler and Morrison (2000)  
Smith (2013, 2021)  
Wilkins (2013)  
Osler (2009)  
Warmington et al (2017)  
Olsson-Rost, Sinclair and Warner (2020) |
| Anti-racist pedagogies in ITE are not embedded across institutions | • Reproduction of institutional racism in ITE  
• Poor BAGM recruitment and retention in ITE – assimilation to whiteness  
• Stifled career progression for BAGM NQT’s  
• ITE students do not feel confident to challenge racism  
• Continuation of ‘one off multicultural days’ or anti-racist seminars which do not effectively challenge racism as evidenced by the high | Joseph-Salisbury (2020)  
YMCA: Young and Black (2020)  
Flintoff et al. (2014)  
Biley and Sollic (2017)  
Warner (2018) |
number of ITE students and ITE tutors who lack confidence to challenge racism and develop anti-racist pedagogies

- One off days which employ BAGM speakers/teachers reproduce racism by laying the responsibility of dismantling on the shoulders of BAGM individuals
- One off days via large anti-racist lectures work with the tools of whiteness to make racism appear irrelevant
- Anti-racist pedagogies cannot rely on reflection alone

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Marom</td>
<td>2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Olsson-Rost et al</td>
<td>2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Picower</td>
<td>2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leonardo,</td>
<td>2003 and 2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Martin</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Okagaki</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ryan and Dixon</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lachuk and Mosley</td>
<td>2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maylor</td>
<td>2009 and 2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indigenous Control of Indian Education Policy</td>
<td>2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wilkins and Lall</td>
<td>2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McNamara and Basit</td>
<td>2004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shah and Shaikh</td>
<td>2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arday, and Weekes-Bernard</td>
<td>2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bhopal and Rhamie</td>
<td>2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>King</td>
<td>1991</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solomona et al.</td>
<td>2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McNamara and Basit</td>
<td>2004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Webbi</td>
<td>2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rodriguez-Mojica et al</td>
<td>2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marrun et al</td>
<td>2019</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ITE tutors lacking knowledge and confidence to develop anti-racist pedagogies

- Reproduces avoidance of race, reflecting the narrative in mainstream society.
- Reproduction of institutional racism in ITE
- Poor BAGM recruitment and retention in ITE
- ITE students do not feel confident to challenge racism
- The responsibility to develop anti-racist pedagogies falls to the staff who have the motivation and knowledge to embed it removing responsibility from the institution to embed anti-racist pedagogies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Postner</td>
<td>2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O’ Brien</td>
<td>2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bonilla-Silva</td>
<td>2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lopez</td>
<td>2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lander</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gillborn</td>
<td>2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Callender</td>
<td>2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leonardo and Porter</td>
<td>2010</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- Reproduction of institutional racism where individual ITE tutors, in the belief they are being anti-racist by supporting individual BAGM ITE students, without challenging the institutional processes which contribute to poor BAGM recruitment and retention in ITE – namely anti-racist pedagogies not being embedded in the ITE provision
- EAL pupils are positioned as inferior in policy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>There is a clear need for anti-racist pedagogies to be embedded in all ITE provision</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>There is a clear need for anti-racist pedagogies to be embedded in all ITE provision</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- ITE students confident and able to challenge all forms of racism and embed anti-racism in their teaching practice
- Counteracting the tools of whiteness – denial, avoidance, silence, deflection, colourblind ideology
- Preventing assimilation to white supremacist norms
- Improve racial literacy of ITE students and tutors
- ITE tutors have the knowledge and institutional support to teach anti-racism
- Improvement in recruitment and retention of BAGM ITE students
- Wider impact of embedded anti-racism teaching in ITE:
  - Decrease the attainment gap of BAGM pupils
  - Improvement in how racism is challenged in schools
  - A teacher workforce that is more reflective of the population
  - Newly qualified teachers are better placed to support all pupils and prepare them to work and live in racially diverse communities
  - Decolonised curriculum
  - Inclusive school policies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>References</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Devine (2005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gillborn (2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feagin (2001)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cole and Stuart (2005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McNamara and Basit (2004)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poku (2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Centre for Education Statistics (2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Basic Education (2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mansouri and Jenkins (2010)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Priest et al 2014 in Forrest, Lean and Dunn (2015)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bhopal and Rhamie (2013)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arday and Mirza (2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maylor (2014, 2016 and 2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lander (2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lewis (2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farbin et al (2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leonardo (2009)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bell (2007)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crozier and Davies (2008)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gilmer (2007)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smith and Lander (2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wilkins (2013)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bhopal and Rhamie (2013)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flintoff et al. (2014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arday and Mirza (2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joseph-Salisbury (2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Villegas and Lucas (2002)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whigham and Hobson (2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walsh (2001)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
There are examples of excellent anti-racist pedagogies in ITE programs, but they are dependent on specific ITE tutors who have knowledge of Critical Race Theory (CRT), Critical White Studies (CWS) and passion to push the agenda. The institution where ITE provision takes place must support embedding anti-racist pedagogies.

Examples of anti-racist pedagogies, all use a CRT framework:
- The white ally approach
- Critical reflection of whiteness (CWS) – including how the concept of whiteness is internalised by BAGM ITE students
- Counter storytelling to encourage critical self-reflection

Global examples of anti-racist pedagogies in ITE are available and can be adopted into a wider anti-racist framework for ITE.
- If the ITE tutors who have developed anti-racist pedagogies leave the institution, the work can fall to the side
- Whiteness as the norm is critically investigated allowing student teachers to develop understanding about how race and racism manifests and operates as a structural system within a white supremacist framework as opposed to an individual approach
- Denial, resistance, avoidance by student teachers to anti-racism is reduced supporting critical analysis regarding race producing change in how race and racism is recognised in teaching.

Examples of anti-racist pedagogies:
- Smith (2014) - Emotional responses to documentary viewing and the potential for transformative teaching
- Matias and Mackey (2015) - Breakin' down whiteness in antiracist teaching: Introducing critical whiteness pedagogy
- Lachuk and Mosely (2012) - Us and Them? Entering a three dimensional narrative inquiry space with white pre-service teachers to explore race, racism, and anti-racism
- Aveling (2006) - Hacking at our very roots': rearticulating White racial identity within the context of teacher education
- Puchner and Markowitz (2014) - Using an adult development model to help explain pre-service teacher resistance to learning about race
• Emotional based approach - using the work of BAGM authors/speakers/conference leaders and documentaries especially intimate technology via social media
• Video Cue Ethnography between parents of colour and preservice teachers
• Kegan’s constructive developmental model – for ITE tutors to understand resistance and denial
• Centering the Black imagination
• ITE tutors being part of, and having connections with teacher activist networks
• Neo abolitionist pedagogies – to reflect and dismantle whiteness
• Teaching the contribution/sacrifice of BAGM to society – Ladson-Billings the debt we owe as opposed to the lack of the ‘other’
• Fanonian theory of safety in race dialogue - Risk and discomfort should be embraced by ITE tutors as part of the anti-racist dialogue.
• Privilege Education program - Adoption of an intersectional approach in anti-racist pedagogies – changing behaviours is a more useful undertaking than changing attitudes. Under this, constructs such as identity, gender, class and race are discussed before moving to activities such as, Walking through white privilege and review of the documentary, A girl like me
• Centering purpose as a way of helping white trainee history teachers engage with diversity issues - Change is more likely to occur in a teacher’s ideas and actions if they appreciate the need for change and that change is more likely to occur where it is closely linked to a teacher’s sense of identity, which is often centered around their identity as a subject teacher (p. 221)
• Critical literacy workshops to explore historical creation of race and racism
• Everyday Antiracism for Educators (EAR) – Identified the following core tensions: What can I do? –

Mary and Riley (2017) - "Change Happens Beyond the Comfort Zone."
Picower (2012) – Teacher activism: Enacting a vision for social justice
Campbell and Valauri (2019) - "Our Voices Matter: Using Video-Cued Ethnography to Facilitate a Conversation about Race between Parents of Color and Preservice Teachers."
Ladson – Billings (2019) - Teacher Education in a Racialized Society: An Interview with Gloria Ladson-Billings
Leonardo and Porter (2010) - Pedagogy of fear: toward a Fanonian theory of ‘safety’ in race dialogue
Jones and McNamara (2004) - The possibilities and constraints of multimedia as a basis for critical reflection
Harris (2012) - 'Purpose' as a way of helping white trainee history teachers engage with diversity issues.
A three dimensional narrative inquiry with pre-service teachers and ITE tutors - ~Lachuk and Mosley (2012)  
References


Akala. 2019 Natives: Race and Class in the Ruins of Empire London: Two Roads


Bunglawala, Z., 2019. ‘Please don’t call me BAME or BME!’ [online] Available at: <https://civilservice.blog.gov.uk/2019/07/08/please-dont-call-me-bame-or-bme/> [Accessed 18 July 2021].


